

*I AGREE*

JAMES A. DINSMOOR

INDIANA UNIVERSITY

It is difficult or impossible to write a long but detailed commentary on a target article with which one agrees almost completely. The result may very well be that the sample of commentaries obtained on Donahoe, Palmer, and Burgos' statement of their position will be heavily skewed in a direction opposed to their point of view. Such a sample is probably not representative of the field, judging from the reactions of other behavior analysts with whom I have discussed the matter. In an attempt to improve the balance, I would like to go on record as saying that there is almost nothing in their presentation with which I disagree.

In addition, I can add a few supporting observations based on data from real animals on traditional procedures. That is: It might appear that when a response is initially reinforced under so-called "constant" stimulus conditions, no control by antecedent stimuli occurs. But, as Pavlov noted, in respondent conditioning the entire experimental chamber, as contrasted with the environment outside of that chamber, becomes for a time a

conditional stimulus (1927/1960, p. 115). Moreover, the acquisition of the conditional response is often measured by a comparison between the subject's behavior in the presence of the stimulus chosen by the experimenter to be paired with the unconditional stimulus and its behavior when that stimulus is absent, that is, by the formation of a discrimination (Dinsmoor, 1995). In operant conditioning, initial reinforcement of pecking in the presence of a single key color can lead to a performance in which no pecking occurs when an alternative color is later presented. This is Terrace's (1963) "errorless discrimination," but in my laboratory we have obtained the same effect without using the special experimental routine adopted by Terrace.

## REFERENCES

- Dinsmoor, J. A. (1995). Stimulus control: Part I. *The Behavior Analyst*, 18, 51–68.
- Pavlov, I. P. (1960). *Conditioned reflexes: An investigation of the physiological activity of the cerebral cortex* (G. V. Anrep, Trans.). New York: Dover. (Original work published 1927)
- Terrace, H. S. (1963). Discrimination learning with and without "errors." *Journal of the Experimental Analysis of Behavior*, 6, 1–27.

---

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to James Dinsmoor, Department of Psychology, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 47405-1301 (E-mail: dinsmoor@indiana.edu).